Message

From: FertikEdgerton, Rachel [FertikEdgerton.Rachel@epa.gov]

Sent: 7/24/2018 6:18:41 PM

To: Kaiser, Russell [Kaiser.Russell@epa.gov]; Hurld, Kathy [Hurld.Kathy@epa.gov]; Kupchan, Simma

[Kupchan.Simma@epa.gov]

CC: Frazer, Brian [Frazer.Brian@epa.gov]; Goodin, John [Goodin.John@epa.gov]; McDavit, Michael W.

[Mcdavit.Michael@epa.gov]; Wade, Alexis [Wade.Alexis@epa.gov]

Subject: RE: ACTION FW: Shellfish Follow-up

Too late, here is my draft:

Ex. 5 Deliberative Process (DP)

From: Kaiser, Russell

Sent: Tuesday, July 24, 2018 1:39 PM

To: Hurld, Kathy < Hurld. Kathy@epa.gov>; Kupchan, Simma < Kupchan. Simma@epa.gov>; FertikEdgerton, Rachel

<FertikEdgerton.Rachel@epa.gov>

Cc: Frazer, Brian <Frazer.Brian@epa.gov>; Goodin, John <Goodin.John@epa.gov>; McDavit, Michael W.

<Mcdavit.Michael@epa.gov>; Wade, Alexis <Wade.Alexis@epa.gov>

Subject: RE: ACTION FW: Shellfish Follow-up

All – pls - - pens down. I have talked with Alexis and she is going to review and revise or pull something from the CWR. Thanks Alexis.

Russell L. Kaiser

Chief, Freshwater and Marine Regulatory Branch Oceans, Wetlands and Communities Division Office of Wetlands, Oceans and Watersheds 1301 Constitution Ave., N.W.

Room 7114B West Bldg. Washington, DC 20004

P: 202.566.0963

Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)

From: Kaiser, Russell

Sent: Tuesday, July 24, 2018 1:30 PM

To: Hurld, Kathy < Hurld, Kathy@epa.gov; FertikEdgerton, Rachel

<FertikEdgerton.Rachel@epa.gov>

Cc: Frazer, Brian < Frazer. Brian@epa.gov>; Goodin, John < Goodin. John@epa.gov>; McDavit, Michael W.

<<u>Mcdavit.Michael@epa.gov</u>>; Wade, Alexis <<u>Wade.Alexis@epa.gov</u>>

Subject: RE: ACTION FW: Shellfish Follow-up

Ex. 5 Deliberative Process (DP)

Ex. 5 Deliberative Process (DP)

Ex. 5 Deliberative Process (DP) Thank you

Russell L. Kaiser

Chief, Freshwater and Marine Regulatory Branch Oceans, Wetlands and Communities Division Office of Wetlands, Oceans and Watersheds 1301 Constitution Ave., N.W. Room 7114B West Bldg. Washington, DC 20004 P: 202.566.0963

From: Hurld, Kathy

Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)

Sent: Tuesday, July 24, 2018 12:17 PM

To: Kupchan, Simma < Kupchan, Simma@epa.gov>; FertikEdgerton, Rachel < FertikEdgerton, Rachel@epa.gov>; Kaiser,

Russell < Kaiser. Russell@epa.gov>

Cc: Frazer, Brian <Frazer.Brian@epa.gov>; Goodin, John <Goodin.John@epa.gov>; McDavit, Michael W.

< Mcdavit. Michael@epa.gov>; Wade, Alexis < Wade. Alexis@epa.gov>

Subject: RE: ACTION FW: Shellfish Follow-up

I sent an additional sentence to Alexis and Simma to consider that

Ex. 5 Deliberative Process (DP)

Ex. 5 Deliberative Process (DP)

From: Kupchan, Simma

Sent: Tuesday, July 24, 2018 10:57 AM

To: FertikEdgerton, Rachel <FertikEdgerton.Rachel@epa.gov>; Kaiser, Russell <Kaiser.Russell@epa.gov>

Cc: Hurld, Kathy < Hurld. Kathy@epa.gov>; Frazer, Brian < Frazer. Brian@epa.gov>; Goodin, John < Goodin. John@epa.gov>;

McDavit, Michael W. < Mcdavit. Michael@epa.gov>; Wade, Alexis < Wade. Alexis@epa.gov>

Subject: RE: ACTION FW: Shellfish Follow-up

Thanks, Rachel.

Alexis, could you take a look at the language below? (Alexis is not actually in the office at the moment and is dealing with some other matters, but kindly offered to help with this today as soon as is free. Thank you, Alexis!)

Ex. 5 AC/DP

Simma Kupchan **EPA Office of General Counsel** Water Law Office 202-564-3105 WJC North #7426Q

From: FertikEdgerton, Rachel

Sent: Tuesday, July 24, 2018 10:48 AM

To: Kaiser, Russell < Kaiser.Russell@epa.gov>; Kupchan, Simma < Kupchan.Simma@epa.gov>

Cc: Hurld, Kathy < Hurld. Kathy@epa.gov>; Frazer, Brian < Frazer. Brian@epa.gov>; Goodin, John < Goodin. John@epa.gov>;

McDavit, Michael W. < McDavit, Michael@epa.gov Subject: RE: ACTION FW: Shellfish Follow-up

Here is some draft language for Simma and Alexis to review. Citations could be moved to footnotes for improved readability.

Ex. 5 AC/DP

Please continue to reply-all so we all stay up to speed since this is a quick turnaround.

Thanks, Rachel

From: Kaiser, Russell

Sent: Tuesday, July 24, 2018 9:11 AM

To: FertikEdgerton, Rachel < FertikEdgerton.Rachel@epa.gov >; Kupchan, Simma < Kupchan.Simma@epa.gov >

Cc: Hurld, Kathy < Hurld. Kathy@epa.gov >; Frazer, Brian < Frazer. Brian@epa.gov >; Goodin, John < Goodin. John@epa.gov >;

McDavit, Michael W. < McDavit, Michael@epa.gov Subject: FW: ACTION FW: Shellfish Follow-up

Rachel,

I need you to work on the below task ASAP. Response can be brief. For example, two sentences. One Ex. 5 Deliberative Process (DP

Ex. 5 Deliberative Process (DP)

Rachel – after we reach agreement on the language, pls insert as described below and forward to all parties. **Please note this is due today**.

Russell L. Kaiser Chief, Freshwater and I

Chief, Freshwater and Marine Regulatory Branch Oceans, Wetlands and Communities Division Office of Wetlands, Oceans and Watersheds

1301 Constitution Ave., N.W.

Room 7114B West Bldg. Washington, DC 20004

P: 202.566.0963

Ex. 6 Personal Privacy (PP)

From: Goodin, John

Sent: Tuesday, July 24, 2018 8:26 AM

To: Frazer, Brian < Frazer. Brian@epa.gov>; Kaiser, Russell < Kaiser. Russell@epa.gov>

Cc: Connors, Sandra < Connors. Sandra@epa.gov>; McDavit, Michael W. < Mcdavit. Michael@epa.gov>

Subject: ACTION FW: Shellfish Follow-up

Morning, Folks--Need to do this today

Ex. 5 Deliberative Process (DP)

Ex. 5 Deliberative Process (DP)

Thanks John

From: Forsgren, Lee

Sent: Tuesday, July 24, 2018 8:15 AM
To: Goodin, John < Goodin, John@epa.gov>

Subject: RE: Shellfish Follow-up

John,

Can you put in the ESA discussion and then I will get this to Chairman Graves.

Lee

From: Goodin, John

Sent: Monday, July 23, 2018 2:56 PM **To:** Forsgren, Lee <<u>Forsgren, Lee@epa.gov</u>>

Subject: Shellfish Follow-up

Per discussion, see below.

Ex. 5 Deliberative Process (DP)

Ex. 5 Deliberative Process (DP)

Sent from my iPhone

Begin forwarded message:

From: Goodin, John

Sent: Tuesday, June 12, 2018 2:49 PM **To:** Forsgren, Lee Forsgren.Lee@epa.gov>

Cc: Campbell, Ann < Campbell. Ann@epa.gov>; Frazer, Brian < Frazer. Brian@epa.gov>; Russell Kaiser < Kaiser. Russell@epa.gov>; Sandra Connors (Connors. Sandra@epa.gov) < Connors. Sandra@epa.gov>

Subject: Shellfish Follow-up

Lee—below is our coordinated response with OGC that addresses the questions below regarding

Ex. 5 Deliberative Process (DP)

Thanks,			
John			

Question: do normal commercial shellfish farming activities usually result in discharges of dredged or fill material, as those terms are defined under Section 404 of the Clean Water Act?

Answer:

Ex. 5 Deliberative Process (DP)

Question: To the extent any shellfish farming activities do involve regulated discharges of dredged or fill material, is the Clean Water Act Section 404(f)(1)(A) exemption applicable to shellfish farming, including seeding, cultivation, and harvesting activities?

Answer:					
Ex. 5 Deliberative Process (DP)					

From: "Forsgren, Lee" < Forsgren. Lee@epa.gov>

Date: June 5, 2018 at 10:12:11 PM EDT

To: "Bennitt, Ian" < !an.Bennitt@mail.house.gov">!an.Bennitt@mail.house.gov

Cc: "Goodin, John" < Goodin.John@epa.gov>, "Ross, David P" < ross.davidp@epa.gov>,

"Ringel, Aaron" <ringel.aaron@epa.gov>, "Lyons, Troy" <lyons.troy@epa.gov>

Subject: Re: Shellfish

lan,

Let me do some checking and get back to you ASAP.

Lee

Sent from my iPhone

On Jun 5, 2018, at 9:19 PM, Bennitt, lan < lan.Bennitt@mail.house.gov > wrote:

Lee – following up. Can we request some TA from yall with regard to our shellfish issue. Specifically, we would like to know whether EPA concurs with the Army Corps of Engineers' position, as stated in the March 2016 draft preamble to the 2017 Nationwide Permit 48, regarding the applicability of Section 404 of the Clean Water Act to commercial shellfish farming activities, including:

- That normal commercial shellfish farming activities usually do not result in discharges of dredged or fill material, as those terms are defined under Section 404 of the Clean Water Act; and
- ii. That, to the extent any shellfish farming activities do involve regulated discharges of dredged or fill material, the Clean Water Act Section 404(f)(1)(A) exemption is applicable to shellfish farming, including seeding, cultivation, and harvesting activities.

Thanks for your help,

Ian H. Bennitt

Staff Director, Water Resources and Environment Subcommittee

Committee on Transportation and Infrastructure

202-225-4360

This email and any related communications, documents, notes, draft legislation, recommendations, reports, or other materials generated or received by the Members or staff of the U.S. House of Representatives Committee on Transportation and Infrastructure are congressional records and remain subject to the Committee's control, and are entrusted to your agency only for use in handling this matter. Any such documents created or compiled by an agency in connection with

any response to this Committee document or any related Committee communications, whether made by phone, email, or document, including any replies to the Committee, are also records of the Committee and remain subject to the Committee's control. Accordingly, the aforementioned documents are not "agency records" for purposes of the Freedom of Information Act or any other law, and should be segregated from agency records.